Country reports about anticipating and matching: 
A first synthesis

Lorenz Lassnigg  
(lassnigg@ihs.ac.at; www.equi.at)  
Input to 2nd meeting of the experts' network:
“Anticipating and matching demand and supply of skills in ETF partner countries”
Workshop on 24-25 October 2011, ETF, Turin

Agenda

- Session 1: Overview about concepts and results
  - Matching, skills, anticipation
  - Mapping of main issues
  - Situational analysis
  - Data availability
  - Methods of anticipating skill demands
  - Policy analysis

- Session 2-3: Topics for further discussion
  - 1. Institutional separation/cooperation Education – Economy
  - 2. Notice/observation/meanings of mismatch: informal-communicative vs. evidence
  - 3. Different main issues in education in different countries: ‘too much’ (overeducation) vs. ‘not enough’ (increase basic education); higher education vs. intermediate VET education/training
  - 4. Consideration of demand issues in provision of education (approaches of ‘matching’ at policy level)
  - 5. Role and approaches of ‘anticipation’
  - 6. Policy approaches of combining matching and anticipation
CONCEPTS: Matching

Levels, individual and aggregate

Systems

Institutions

Aggregate

Individual
At the core of matching: individual characteristics and job characteristics

...dynamic and unobservable

Aggregate: complex influences on individuals‘ and jobs‘ characteristics
Aggregate: complex influences on individuals’ and jobs’ characteristics

Policies must take into account complex interrelations between structures and micro-behaviour

Key aspect at aggregate level: Information represented by symbolic structures

...information is much more than ‘facts’

SYMBOLIC STRUCTURES: KSCs, programmes, qualifications, occupations, job descriptions, sectors

MEASUREMENT

Statistical aggregations, distributions of units

INFORMATION

Structures

Incentives

‘Good Match’
Matching has also an institutional dimension, aggregate attempts

**Systems**

**Institutions**

**SYMBOLOC STUCTURES:** KSCs, programmes, qualifications, occupations, job descriptions, sectors

**Aggregate**

**Individual**

**LABOUR MARKET**

**MEASUREMENT**

**INFORMATION**

**ECONOMY**

Min. Ec.

Economic Representatives

Economic Sectors

Companies, enterprises

**TRANSPORT**

**ECONOMY**

***Values/goals + productivity?***

Production of peoples' charactersitics

Production of jobs' characteristics

"Good Match"
Matching/mismatch

- Matching of persons to jobs ultimately achieved at **individual level**, mediated through labour market; internal and external movements

- **'Good match'** includes **many characteristics** of persons and jobs, which are differently produced, different players may have **different criteria** (normative)
  - Economy: mainly productivity
  - Individuals: manifold
  - Education: complex
    - role and impact of education in production of persons' characteristics not so clear
    - emphasis on productivity not selfevident (conflicts about goals and values)

- **Key aspects in matching**: incentives, information, institutions/structures; the latter influence the former

- **Approaches** for improvement of matching on different aspects
  - Key point for policy: relationship between **information & institutions/structures**

---

**CONCEPTS: Skills, qualifications**
Skills/qualifications

Skills are a key element in matching persons to jobs...

...meaning of 'skills' includes many aspects, concept used differently
- often general expression of capabilities of people at/for work (economics), often not separated from qualification
- KSC: technically specific aspect of capabilities, separated from knowledge (declarative) and competences (social, personal)
  technical/operational aspect of immediate practical performance of work tasks
- specifically in relation to qualifications: content aspect (skill) vs. credential aspect (qualification means certificate)
  Key issue: which skills are represented by a certificate/qualification

Matching with respect to skills used in different meanings that are often merged and confused
- content/qualitative meaning: do people have the right skills to perform a job?
- formal/quantitative: do the qualifications of people correspond to their job?

The different meanings have strong consequences for measurement
CONCEPTS: Anticipation

Anticipation and matching: TIME

Educational Systems  Educational Sectors  Economic Sectors
Educational Providers
Policies
Economic Representatives
Companies, enterprises
Labour Market

Symbolic Structures:
- KSCs, programmes, qualifications, occupations, job descriptions, sectors
- Educational Sectors
- Economic Sectors
- Min. Ed.
- Min. Lab./Soc.
- Min. Ec.
- Educational Providers
- Educational Systems
- Economic Sectors
- Economic Representatives
- Companies, enterprises
- Labour Market

Measurement:
- Statistical aggregations, distributions of units

Information:
- Productivity
- Structures
- Incentives
- 'Good Match'

Spaces:
- Transnational
- National
- Regional
- Local

Labour Market Policies:
- Min. Lab./Soc.
Anticipation and matching: FUNCTION 1
Knowledge Creation

Spaces
- transnational
- national
- regional
- local

Systems
- Educational Systems
- Educational Sectors
- Educational Providers

Institutions
- Policy Represenatives
- Economic Representatives

Aggregate
- People Characteristics
- Jobs Characteristics

Individual
- Production
- People's characteristics
- Jobs' characteristics

Incentives
- Movements, changes
- 'Good Match'

Measurement
- Statistical aggregations, distributions of units

Information
- Structures
- Incentives
- Productivity

Knowledge Creation:
- Forecasting
- Projections
- Surveys
- etc.

Symbolic Structures:
- KSCs, programmes, qualifications, occupations, job descriptions, sectors
Anticipation and matching

- brings time into matching by focusing on future demands…

- …however, future has already been implicitly before by different expectations of actors and their acting towards them
  - individuals expectations are strongly influenced by their origin and past experience (‘social capital’)
  - educational actors have traditionally a long term perspective (life-time education)
  - economic actors bring in the short term development of the market

- Key questions of anticipation are
  - (1) knowledge: how actors can know more about the future and
  - (2) implementation: how to bring this knowledge into practice…

- Activities, functions that might improve matching:
  - improvement of knowledge (baseline): ‘evidence’ – observation // communication
  - influence/change expectations/practices by better information
  - influence/change incentives, institutions, structures based on better information
Generalised highlights from country reports

- Main issues
- Situational analysis
- Data
- Anticipation
- Policy analysis

Mapping of main issues

- Understandings
  - Skills
    mostly diffuse understanding of the term; often technical/professional skills
  - Matching/mismatch
    mostly weak evidence; rather narrative-communicative beliefs; mostly current
    often vacancies/unemployed by occupations; overeducation, wrong specialisations, public-private; difference qualifications – practical skills (quantity-quality); regions
  - Anticipation
    commonly gap between demand for anticipation and practices of anticipation
    most interest/involvement by employment service; most practices employers’ surveys;
    available approaches not much used (paradox?)

- Main problems of mismatch / future demand
  - quantity-quality problem, gap education – economy and labour market,
    gap public – private
  - complexity: mixture of aspects (migration, wage-differentials, traditions, etc.)
  - more focus on current problems than future demand (vacancies-unemployed);
    labour market training; future fragile (structural change; crisis-recovery)
  - rather vague ideas than concrete problems, use of supply from higher education
Situational analysis

- **Actors**
  - public: commonly at least **three ministries** involved (education, labour, economy); in large states also regions
  - **employment service/office** commonly most involved/interested in matching and anticipation
  - **employers** voice strongly noticed, however, weakly organised/involved (surveys)
  - **educational institutions**: mostly higher education, VET centres, strong state influence
  - also important: **statistical offices** (data), international organisations (support, advice)
  - emerging: **intermediate actors** (councils, observatories, etc.)

- **Overall patterns of demand and supply**
  - Common: structural change; low employment rate + informal economy, mostly young population (except SERB), modest ageing, hit by crisis
  - Some: strong outward migration (MOL, KYR, SER)

- **Specific mismatches and requirements**
  - **Complaints** quality (EGY, MOL, UKR, KYR); soft skills (EGY, TUR); occupations

Data availability

- **Education**
  - **Education statistics**, quite detailed (enrolment, graduates)
  - **Labour market training**, VET centres not always clear
  - Some specific data in selected countries: accredited institutions, school management

- **Employment**
  - Common: **register data** unemployed, vacancies
  - Quite common: **Labour force survey** (LFS); less: **employers surveys**
  - Some countries: wages, migration
  - Some specific data in selected countries: longitudinal monitoring, outflow unemployment, specific business surveys, manufacturing, child labour

- **Transition**: most countries some specific information: some LFS (module), some specific occasional studies around 2006-08 (MOL).

- **Utilisation**: majority some information (wages, follow-up, surveys) (UKR), however, less comparable
Methods of anticipating skill demands

- All reports quite critical

- Quite common: enterprise surveys
  - mostly short-term (1 year),
  - increasingly established regularly (annual) by employment agencies; just started 2010, 2011
  - some occasional, more mid-term, some sectorial

- Formal statistical approaches: different categories
  - Demand side
    - quite common: current analysis of registered unemployed / vacancies, CRO: outflows
    - frequently: assessment of current demand of public (+private) institutions
    - seldom: demand-side forecasting or projections (EGY forecast; KYR survey+projection)
  - Supply side
    - sometimes: analysis and short term projecting of supply side data

- Some sectorial studies and communicative approaches
  - CRO sector studies; EGY observatory, prospect, enterprise training partnerships;
    (MOL, UKR, KYR) part of broader strategies

Policy analysis

- Basic question: bringing approaches together, utilisation of information

- technical forecasting established as strong priority in some countries...
  - MOL, UKR, KYR part of broader development strategies, already experience in EGY (employment), KYR (projections)
  - ...less or no priority in others (TUR), rather current monitoring (CRO, MON)
  - alternatives: focus on guidance (MON), labour market policy (monitoring), retraining (TUR, MON, CRO), cooperative training (TUR, EGY), institutional cooperation (MON)

- ...embedded in communicative bodies (EGY, KYR, MOL) or only cooperative strategies (CRO)
  - councils, sectorial committees

- problem: implementation of strategies (‘bringing down to earth’)
Agenda

- Session 1: Overview about concepts and results
  - Matching, skills, anticipation
  - Mapping of main issues
  - Situational analysis
  - Data availability
  - Methods of anticipating skill demands
  - Policy analysis

- Session 2-3: Topics for further discussion
  - 1. Institutional separation/cooperation Education – Economy
  - 2. Notice/observation meanings of mismatch: informal-communicative vs. evidence
  - 3. Different main issues in education in different countries: ‘too much’ (overeducation) vs. ‘not enough’ (increase basic education); higher education vs. intermediate VET education/training
  - 4. Consideration of demand issues in provision of education (approaches of ‘matching’ at policy level)
  - 5. Role and approaches of ‘anticipation’
  - 6. Policy approaches of combining matching and anticipation

SESSION 2: Important Aspects and cases

- Institutional separation/cooperation Education – Economy
  CASE-presentation: MOLDOVA

- Notice/observation meanings of mismatch: informal-communicative vs. evidence
  CASE-presentation: CROATIA

- Different main issues in education in different countries: ‘too much’ (overeducation) vs. ‘not enough’ (increase basic education); higher education vs. intermediate VET education/training
  CASE-presentation: TURKEY
1. Institutional separation/cooperation
Education – Economy

- Commonly **three ministries** responsible for issues of matching and anticipation:
  - education (with science), complaints about hesitation, rigidity, slowness…
  - labour (with social affairs, migration),
  - economy (with technology), not so much info

- Most interest and activities with matching and anticipation: **employment agencies** (under responsibility of min.labour)
  - data analysis vacancies, unemployed
  - employer surveys (annually)
  - running also training institutions

- Cooperation/linkages
  - mostly with VET institutions, VET centres (related to labour market policies),
    more difficult: higher education
  - Partnerships, also with enterprises, international co-operation initiatives (small)

Questions 1
How to overcome the separation?

- Decentralisation, market strategies

- More emphasis on implementation issues/concrete action plans

- Involvement of actors in intermediate bodies (councils, observatories)

- Placing VET nearer to labour market authorities

- How to deal with non-economic and long-term objectives of education in relation to the short-term economic demands?
2. Notice/observation/meanings of mismatch: informal-communicative vs. evidence

- in all countries notions of current mismatch, more or less marked, various problems/phenomena
  - graduates do not find employment
    - too many; wrong subjects
  - credentialism, quantity-quality, costs of education
  - unfulfilled demand technical vocational qualifications
  - bottlenecks

- Rather communicative judgement than clear evidence, important source: employers surveys

- Evidence most commonly based on labour market register, vacancies vs. unemployed by occupations, current situation

- Youth transition many studies

- Big question: credibility of evidence, so that can be put into action

Questions 2
Does evidence really help?

- Indications that ‘evidence’, if it exists, is not much utilised, why?

- What are the barriers to the use of evidence?

- How to relate evidence to communicative beliefs and appraisals?

- How to overcome uncertainty and to enhance credibility?
3. Different main issues in education in different countries

- ‘too much’ (overeducation) vs. ‘not enough’ (increase basic education)
  - all countries: strong tendency towards higher education, led by educational demand (particularly KYR, EGY)
  - quality problems related to lack of financing
  - credentialism /selectivity seems to aggravate problem (TUR, EGY), private tutoring
  - more basic education necessary, women (TUR, EGY)

- higher education vs. intermediate VET education/training
  - VET, technical education development: EGY, MON, TUR, KYR
  - combination to labour market policy, adult education development

Questions 3
How to change basic patterns?

- demand for education strong driver, how can it be influenced?

- role of evidence and information

- credibility of evidence

- influencing individuals vs. influencing policies
Agenda

- **Session 1:** Overview about concepts and results
  - Matching, skills, anticipation
  - Mapping of main issues
  - Situational analysis
  - Data availability
  - Methods of anticipating skill demands
  - Policy analysis

- **Session 2-3:** Topics for further discussion
  - 1. Institutional separation/cooperation Education – Economy
  - 2. Notice/observation/meanings of mismatch: informal-communicative vs. evidence
  - 3. Different main issues in education in different countries: ‘too much’ (overeducation) vs. ‘not enough’ (increase basic education); higher education vs. intermediate VET education/training
  - 4. Consideration of demand issues in provision of education (approaches of ‘matching’ at policy level)
  - 5. Role and approaches of ‘anticipation’
  - 6. Policy approaches of combining matching and anticipation

SESSION 3: Important Aspects and cases

- 4. Consideration of demand issues in provision of education (approaches of ‘matching’ at policy level)
  
  CASE-presentation: UKRAINE

- 5. Role and approaches of ‘anticipation’
  
  CASE-presentation: MONTENEGRO

- 6. Policy approaches of combining matching and anticipation
  
  CASE-presentation: EGYPT
4. Consideration of demand issues in provision of education (‘matching’ at policy level)

- Basic problem in matching: individuals can only choose education programmes that are available, and available programmes structure choices, therefore provision of feasible programmes is very important.

- Mostly education authorities are responsible for provision, they have their own logic, and often heavy mechanisms are involved
  - some trade-off between decentralisation/marketization and common goals: education/training cumulative long-term process, later inputs depend on earlier inputs > how to draw distinctions between initial and further education?
  - choices also follow an educational logic with an inherent upward tendency within education: people will follow provision, if there is restriction/selection they will try harder (see TUR), incentives support upward tendency, even with ‘overeducation’ (returns become smaller, but are there)
  - information is necessary for enlightenment, but a weak instrument for influencing choice

- Big unanswered question: what is the real contribution of education to personal characteristics?

Questions 4
How can evidence improve matching?

- How much, and to which actors can information help?

- How to find a balance between decentralised decisions and planning (‘aggregate decisions’)?

- How to deal with established practices of (insufficient) planning?
5. Role and approaches of ‘anticipation’

- First requirement of anticipation is creation of knowledge by data and communicative processes, problem with ‘evidence’ because there can be no proof
  - depending on time scale
  - ‘self-destructing evidence’

- Role is information of the various actors, problem: should not end with knowledge creation, but with knowledge use
  - use for decisions within structures
  - use for decisions that change structures

- Much asked for, mostly low activity criticised, examples are
  - big trend towards employers’ surveys, annually conducted (short-term)
  - KYR: survey combined with projections
  - CRO: ranking based on past flow indicators
  - CRO: sectors councils
  - EGY: observatory

Questions 5
How to bring anticipation into use?

- Can anticipation fulfil expectations and promises, if it is implemented?

- What are pre-conditions to be put into use?
6. Policy approaches of combining matching and anticipation

- Different aspects of policies
  - emphasis on current situation vs. future development
  - planning of supply vs. decentralisation & individual decisions
  - cooperative/communicative approaches (national, sectoral councils; local partnerships)
  - priority setting and embeddedness in broader strategies, legal status of initiatives

- Current mismatch: labour market policy

- Future: orientation and guidance

- Inflexibility of education

- Relation to standards and qualifications frameworks

Questions 6
Strategic practice, top-down-bottom-up

- How to work at the different levels? Strategies without practice vs. practice without strategies…

- Which aspects must be covered by policies? Selective vs. comprehensive…

- How to combine technical and communicative aspects in policies?

- How to combine current needs with the future? Credibility of anticipation